# A parallel deflated Krylov solver for finite element problems 

Kees Vuik, Guus Segal and Fred Vermolen<br>c.vuik@math.tudelft.nl<br>http://ta.twi.tudelft.nl/users/vuik/

Delft University of Technology

Sparse Days and Grid Computing at St. Girons,

Hotel La Clairiere, St. Girons, France, June 10-13, 2003

## Contents

1. Introduction
2. A parallel Krylov method for finite element problems
3. Deflation and Coarse Grid Acceleration
4. Numerical experiments
5. Conclusions

Reinhard Nabben, Jason Frank, Koos Meijerink, Erwin Dufour, Gjalt Wijma, Larbi el Yaakoubi

TU Delft

## 1. Introduction

Motivation
Knowledge of the fluid pressure in rock layers is important for an oil company to predict the presence of oil and gas in reservoirs.


The earth's crust has a layered structure

TU Delft

## Incompressible Navier-Stokes problems

Discretized incompressible Navier-Stokes

- Momentum equations
- Pressure equation
- Transport equation

Coupled problem

$$
\left(\begin{array}{cc}
\mathbf{Q} & \mathbf{G} \\
\mathbf{G}^{T} & \mathbf{0}
\end{array}\right)\binom{u}{p}=\binom{b_{1}}{b_{2}}, u \in \mathbb{R}^{n} \text { and } p \in \mathbb{R}^{m}
$$

Solve the system $A x=b$
TU Delft

## Literature review

- Robust preconditioners (M)ICCG vd Vorst, Meijering, Gustafsson ILUT Saad, MRILU Ploeg, Wubs Navier-Stokes Elman, Silvester, Wathen, Golub RIF Benzi, Tuma


## Literature review

- Robust preconditioners (M)ICCG vd Vorst, Meijering, Gustafsson ILUT Saad, MRILU Ploeg, Wubs Navier-Stokes Elman, Silvester, Wathen, Golub RIF Benzi, Tuma
- Parallel preconditioners Block variants see above ILU Bastian, Horton, Vuik, Nooyen, Wesseling SPAI Grote, Huckle, Benzi, Tuma, Chow, Saad
- Robust preconditioners (M)ICCG vd Vorst, Meijering, Gustafsson ILUT Saad, MRILU Ploeg, Wubs Navier-Stokes Elman, Silvester, Wathen, Golub RIF Benzi, Tuma
- Parallel preconditioners

Block variants see above
ILU Bastian, Horton, Vuik, Nooyen, Wesseling
SPAI Grote, Huckle, Benzi, Tuma, Chow, Saad

- Acceleration of parallel preconditioners CGC Notay, vd Velde, Benzi, Frommer, Nabben, Szyld, Chan, Mathew, Dryja, Widlund, Padiy, Axelsson, Polman
Deflation Nicolaides, Mansfield, Kolotilina, Frank, Vuik Morgan, Chapman, Saad, Burrage, Ehrel, Pohl
FETI Farhat, Roux, Mandel, Klawonn, Widlund


## 2. A parallel Krylov method for finite element problems

## Data distribution




subdomain 2

## TUDelft

## Parallelization of ICCG

ICCG

$$
\begin{aligned}
& k=0, r_{0}=b-A x_{0}, p_{1}=z_{1}=L^{-T} L^{-1} r_{0} \\
& \text { while }\left\|r_{k}\right\|_{2}>\varepsilon \text { do } \\
& \quad k=k+1 \\
& \quad \alpha_{k}=\frac{\left(r_{k-1}, z_{k-1}\right)}{\left(p_{k}, A p_{k}\right)} \\
& \quad x_{k}=x_{k-1}+\alpha_{k} p_{k} \\
& r_{k}=r_{k-1}-\alpha_{k} A p_{k} \\
& z_{k}=L^{-T} L^{-1} r_{k} \\
& \quad \beta_{k}=\frac{\left(r_{k}, z_{k}\right)}{\left(r_{k-1}, z_{k-1}\right)} \\
& \quad p_{k+1}=z_{k}+\beta_{k} p_{k}
\end{aligned}
$$

## TU Delft

## Explanation for a $1 D$ example

Building blocks

- vector update
- inner product
- matrix vector product
- preconditioner vector product

$$
-\frac{d^{2} y}{d x^{2}}=f, \quad y(0)=y(1)=0 .
$$

Take $n=5$ and decompose the domain into two subdomains (1 and 2)

## Vector update

$$
\begin{array}{lllllll}
\underset{0}{x}=0 & 4 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 & { }_{6}^{x}=1
\end{array}
$$

We define $I_{1}=\{1,2,3$,$\} and I_{2}=\{3,4,5\}$. Note that there is an overlap of 1 point.

## Vector update

$$
\begin{array}{lllllll}
x=0 & 4 & 2 & 3 & 4 & 5 & { }_{0}^{x}=1 \\
0 & 4
\end{array}
$$

We define $I_{1}=\{1,2,3$,$\} and I_{2}=\{3,4,5\}$. Note that there is an overlap of 1 point.
Global vector $\mathbf{x}=\left(\begin{array}{c}x_{1} \\ x_{2} \\ x_{3} \\ x_{4} \\ x_{5}\end{array}\right)$, local vectors $\left(\begin{array}{c}x_{1} \\ x_{2} \\ x_{3}\end{array}\right)$ and $\left(\begin{array}{c}x_{3} \\ x_{4} \\ x_{5}\end{array}\right)$.
Vector update is straight forward.

TU Delft

Inner product

- Determine the local innerproduct
- Sum the local innerproducts by MPI_ALLREDUCE


## Inner product

- Determine the local innerproduct
- Sum the local innerproducts by MPI_ALLREDUCE

But

## Inner product

- Determine the local innerproduct
- Sum the local innerproducts by MPI_ALLREDUCE


## But

The contributions of the interface points are used more than once.
Solution: use the interface points only in one local inner product.

## Matrix vector product

$$
A=\left(\begin{array}{rrrrr}
2 & -1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
-1 & 2 & -1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & -1 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0
\end{array}\right)+\left(\begin{array}{rrrrr}
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 1 & -1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & -1 & 2 & -1 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & -1 & 2
\end{array}\right)
$$

## Matrix vector product

$$
A=\left(\begin{array}{cc}
A_{11} & 0 \\
0 & 0
\end{array}\right)+\left(\begin{array}{cc}
0 & 0 \\
0 & A_{22}
\end{array}\right)
$$

## TU Delft

## Matrix vector product

$$
A=\left(\begin{array}{cc}
A_{11} & 0 \\
0 & 0
\end{array}\right)+\left(\begin{array}{cc}
0 & 0 \\
0 & A_{22}
\end{array}\right)
$$

The global matrix vector product $\mathbf{p}=A \mathbf{x}$ :

1. Determine $\left(\begin{array}{c}p_{1} \\ p_{2} \\ p_{3}^{l}\end{array}\right)=A_{11}\left(\begin{array}{l}x_{1} \\ x_{2} \\ x_{3}\end{array}\right)$ and $\left(\begin{array}{c}p_{3}^{r} \\ p_{4} \\ p_{5}\end{array}\right)=A_{22}\left(\begin{array}{l}x_{3} \\ x_{4} \\ x_{5}\end{array}\right)$ in parallel.
2. Communication: send $p_{3}^{l}$ from CPU1 to CPU2 and send $p_{3}^{r}$ from CPU2 to CPU1. (nearest neighbour communication)
3. Determine on both processors $p_{3}=p_{3}^{l}+p_{3}^{r}$ in parallel.

## Parallelization of a block preconditioner

Take as preconditioner the following

$$
\mathbf{p}=P^{-1} \mathbf{x}=\left(\sum_{i=1}^{p} R_{i}^{T} P_{i, i}^{-1} R_{i}\right) \mathbf{x}
$$

where

$$
P_{i, i} \approx A_{i, i}
$$

## Parallelization of a block preconditioner

Take as preconditioner the following

$$
\mathbf{p}=P^{-1} \mathbf{x}=\left(\sum_{i=1}^{p} R_{i}^{T} P_{i, i}^{-1} R_{i}\right) \mathbf{x}
$$

where

$$
P_{i, i} \approx A_{i, i}
$$

In our example

$$
R_{1}=\left(\begin{array}{ccccc}
1 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 1 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0
\end{array}\right) \text { and } R_{2}=\left(\begin{array}{ccccc}
0 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1
\end{array}\right)
$$

TU Delft

## Parallelization of a block preconditioner

The global preconditioner vector product $\mathbf{p}=P^{-1} \mathbf{x}$ :

1. Determine $\left(\begin{array}{c}p_{1} \\ p_{2} \\ p_{3}^{l}\end{array}\right)=P_{11}^{-1}\left(\begin{array}{c}x_{1} \\ x_{2} \\ x_{3}\end{array}\right)$ and $\left(\begin{array}{c}p_{3}^{r} \\ p_{4} \\ p_{5}\end{array}\right)=P_{22}^{-1}\left(\begin{array}{l}x_{3} \\ x_{4} \\ x_{5}\end{array}\right)$ in parallel.
2. Communication: send $p_{3}^{l}$ from CPU1 to CPU2 and send $p_{3}^{r}$ from CPU2 to CPU1. (nearest neighbour communication)
3. Determine on both processors $p_{3}=p_{3}^{l}+p_{3}^{r}$ in parallel.

## 3. Deflation and Coarse Grid Acceleration

$$
\begin{gathered}
A \text { is SPD, Conjugate Gradients } \\
P=I-A Z E^{-1} Z^{T} \text { with } E=Z^{T} A Z
\end{gathered}
$$

and $Z=\left[z_{1} \ldots z_{m}\right]$, where $z_{1}, \ldots, z_{m}$ are independent deflation vectors.

## Properties

1. $P^{T} Z=0$ and $P A Z=0$
2. $P^{2}=P$
3. $A P^{T}=P A$

## Deflated ICCG

$$
x=\left(I-P^{T}\right) x+P^{T} x
$$

## TU Delft

## Deflated ICCG

$$
\begin{aligned}
x & =\left(I-P^{T}\right) x+P^{T} x, \\
\left(I-P^{T}\right) x=Z E^{-1} Z^{T} A x & =Z E^{-1} Z^{T} b,
\end{aligned}
$$

## Deflated ICCG

$$
\begin{aligned}
x & =\left(I-P^{T}\right) x+P^{T} x, \\
\left(I-P^{T}\right) x=Z E^{-1} Z^{T} A x & =Z E^{-1} Z^{T} b, \quad A P^{T} x=P A x=P b .
\end{aligned}
$$

## Deflated ICCG

$$
\begin{aligned}
x & =\left(I-P^{T}\right) x+P^{T} x \\
\left(I-P^{T}\right) x=Z E^{-1} Z^{T} A x & =Z E^{-1} Z^{T} b, \quad A P^{T} x=P A x=P b
\end{aligned}
$$

DICCG
$k=0, \hat{r}_{0}=\operatorname{Pr}_{0}, p_{1}=z_{1}=L^{-T} L^{-1} \hat{r}_{0} ;$
while $\left\|\hat{r}_{k}\right\|_{2}>\varepsilon$ do

$$
\begin{aligned}
& k=k+1 \\
& \alpha_{k}=\frac{\left(\hat{r}_{k-1}, z_{k-1}\right)}{\left(p_{k}, P A p_{k}\right)} \\
& x_{k}=x_{k-1}+\alpha_{k} p_{k} \\
& \hat{r}_{k}=\hat{r}_{k-1}-\alpha_{k} P A p_{k} \\
& z_{k}=L^{-T} L^{-1} \hat{r}_{k} ; \\
& \beta_{k}=\frac{\left(\hat{r}_{k}, z_{k}\right)}{\left(\hat{r}_{k-1}, z_{k-1}\right)} ; \quad p_{k+1}=z_{k}+\beta_{k} p_{k} ;
\end{aligned}
$$

end while

## Variants for values at interfaces

$$
z_{i}=1 \text { on } \Omega_{i} \text { and } z_{i}=0 \text { on } \Omega \backslash \bar{\Omega}_{i}
$$

1. no overlap
$z_{i}=1$ at one subdomain
$z_{i}=0$ at other subdomains
2. complete overlap
$z_{i}=1$ at all subdomains
3. average overlap
$z_{i}=\frac{1}{n_{\text {neighbors }}}$ at all subdomains
4. weighted overlap $(-\operatorname{div}(\sigma \nabla u)=f)$

$$
z_{i}=\frac{\sigma(i)}{\sum \sigma(\text { neighbors })}
$$

## Error for Block IC and Deflation

## Results for constant coefficients



TU Delft

## Error for Block IC and Deflation

Results for constant coefficients

and disontinuous coefficients


TU Delft

## Parallel implementation (initialization)

| Processor 1 | Processor 2 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Make $z_{1}$ | communication | Make $z_{2}$ |
|  |  | $z_{1 \Gamma}$ |
| $z_{2 \Gamma}$ | communication |  |
| Make $A z_{1}$ and $A z_{2 \Gamma}$ |  | sum up |
| sum up |  | $E_{22}=z_{2}^{T} A z_{2}$, |
| $E_{11}=z_{1}^{T} A z_{1}$, |  | $E_{12}=z_{2}^{T} A z_{1 \Gamma}$ |
| $E_{12}=z_{1}^{T} A z_{2 \Gamma}$ |  |  |
| Determine Choleski |  |  |
| decomposition of $E$ |  |  |

TU Delft

## Parallel implementation (during iteration)

$$
P \mathbf{v}=\mathbf{v}-A Z\left(Z^{T} A Z\right)^{-1} Z^{T} \mathbf{v}=\mathbf{v}-A Z E^{-1} Z^{T} \mathbf{v}
$$

| Processor 1 | Processor 2 |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Compute $z_{1}^{T} v$ |  | Compute $z_{2}^{T} v$ |
|  | communication |  |

$$
y=E^{-1}\binom{z_{1}^{T} v}{z_{2}^{T} v}
$$

communication

$$
\mathbf{v}-y_{1} A z_{1}-y_{2} A z_{2 \Gamma} \quad \mathbf{v}-y_{1} A z_{1 \Gamma}-y_{2} A z_{2}
$$

TU Delft

## Coarse Grid Correction of ICCG

## Definition

- $Z \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$ with independent columns.
$-E=Z^{T} A Z \in \mathbb{R}^{m \times m}, E$ is SPD.
- $P_{C}=L^{-T} L^{-1}+\sigma Z E^{-1} Z^{T}$.

CICCG
$k=0, r_{0}=b-A x_{0}, p_{1}=z_{1}=L^{-T} L^{-1} r_{0} ;$
while $\left\|r_{k}\right\|_{2}>\varepsilon$ do
$k=k+1 ;$
$\alpha_{k}=\frac{\left(r_{k-1}, z_{k-1}\right)}{\left(p_{k}, A p_{k}\right)}$;
$x_{k}=x_{k-1}+\alpha_{k} p_{k}$;
$r_{k}=r_{k-1}-\alpha_{k} A p_{k}$;
$z_{k}=P_{C} r_{k}=L^{-T} L^{-1} r_{k}+\sigma Z E^{-1} Z^{T} r_{k} ;$
$\beta_{k}=\frac{\left(r_{k}, z_{k}\right)}{\left(r_{k-1}, z_{k-1}\right)} ; \quad p_{k+1}=z_{k}+\beta_{k} p_{k} ;$
end while
TUDelft

## Properties of Deflation and CGC

$$
P_{D}=I-A Z E^{-1} Z^{T} \quad P_{C}=I+\sigma Z E^{-1} Z^{T}
$$

## TU Delft

## Properties of Deflation and CGC

$$
P_{D}=I-A Z E^{-1} Z^{T} \quad P_{C}=I+\sigma Z E^{-1} Z^{T}
$$

Properties of $P_{D}$

- $P_{D} A$ is symmetric and positive semidefinite
- $P_{D}$ is a projection, $P_{D} A Z=0$
- since $P_{D} A$ is singular, a good termination criterion is important


## Properties of Deflation and CGC

$$
P_{D}=I-A Z E^{-1} Z^{T} \quad P_{C}=I+\sigma Z E^{-1} Z^{T}
$$

Properties of $P_{D}$

- $P_{D} A$ is symmetric and positive semidefinite
- $P_{D}$ is a projection, $P_{D} A Z=0$
- since $P_{D} A$ is singular, a good termination criterion is important

Properties of $P_{C}$

- $P_{C}$ is symmetric positive definite
- $A^{\frac{1}{2}}\left(P_{C}-I\right) A^{\frac{1}{2}}$ is a projection


## Properties of Deflation and CGC

Definition
Eigenpair $\left\{\lambda_{i}, v_{i}\right\}$, so $A v_{i}=\lambda_{i} v_{i}$ with $0<\lambda_{1} \leq \ldots \leq \lambda_{n}$. Take $Z=\left[v_{1} \ldots v_{m}\right]$.

## Properties of Deflation and CGC

Definition
Eigenpair $\left\{\lambda_{i}, v_{i}\right\}$, so $A v_{i}=\lambda_{i} v_{i}$ with $0<\lambda_{1} \leq \ldots \leq \lambda_{n}$.
Take $Z=\left[v_{1} \ldots v_{m}\right]$.
Theorem

- the spectrum of $P_{D} A$ is $\left\{0, \ldots, 0, \lambda_{m+1}, \ldots, \lambda_{n}\right\}$
- the spectrum of $P_{C} A$ is $\left\{\sigma+\lambda_{1}, \ldots, \sigma+\lambda_{m}, \lambda_{m+1}, \ldots, \lambda_{n}\right\}$


## Properties of Deflation and CGC

Definition
Eigenpair $\left\{\lambda_{i}, v_{i}\right\}$, so $A v_{i}=\lambda_{i} v_{i}$ with $0<\lambda_{1} \leq \ldots \leq \lambda_{n}$.
Take $Z=\left[v_{1} \ldots v_{m}\right]$.
Theorem

- the spectrum of $P_{D} A$ is $\left\{0, \ldots, 0, \lambda_{m+1}, \ldots, \lambda_{n}\right\}$
- the spectrum of $P_{C} A$ is $\left\{\sigma+\lambda_{1}, \ldots, \sigma+\lambda_{m}, \lambda_{m+1}, \ldots, \lambda_{n}\right\}$

Corollary
DICCG converges faster than CICCG if $Z=\left[v_{1} \ldots v_{m}\right]$.

TU Delft

## Deflation and Coarse Grid Correction (preliminaries)

Notation: $A, B$ are Hermitian, $A \succeq B$, if $A-B$ is positive semidefinite

## Deflation and Coarse Grid Correction (preliminaries)

Notation: $A, B$ are Hermitian, $A \succeq B$, if $A-B$ is positive semidefinite
Some results from Horn and Johnson, Matrix Analysis

$$
\lambda_{k}(A)+\lambda_{1}(B) \leq \lambda_{k}(A+B) \leq \lambda_{k}(A)+\lambda_{n}(B)
$$

## Deflation and Coarse Grid Correction (preliminaries)

Notation: $A, B$ are Hermitian, $A \succeq B$, if $A-B$ is positive semidefinite
Some results from Horn and Johnson, Matrix Analysis

$$
\lambda_{k}(A)+\lambda_{1}(B) \leq \lambda_{k}(A+B) \leq \lambda_{k}(A)+\lambda_{n}(B)
$$

If $A, B$ are positive definite with $A \succeq B$, then $\lambda_{i}(A) \geq \lambda_{i}(B)$.

## Deflation and Coarse Grid Correction (preliminaries)

Notation: $A, B$ are Hermitian, $A \succeq B$, if $A-B$ is positive semidefinite
Some results from Horn and Johnson, Matrix Analysis

$$
\lambda_{k}(A)+\lambda_{1}(B) \leq \lambda_{k}(A+B) \leq \lambda_{k}(A)+\lambda_{n}(B)
$$

If $A, B$ are positive definite with $A \succeq B$, then $\lambda_{i}(A) \geq \lambda_{i}(B)$.

Suppose that $B$ has rank at most $m$. Then

- $\lambda_{k}(A+B) \leq \lambda_{k+m}(A), \quad k=1,2, \cdots n-m$,
- $\lambda_{k}(A) \leq \lambda_{k+m}(A+B), \quad k=1,2, \cdots n-m$.

TU Delft

## Deflation and Coarse Grid Correction (main result)

Theorem
Let $A$ be symmetric positive definite and $Z$ has rank $Z=m$. Let $E:=Z^{T} A Z$. Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
\lambda_{1}\left(P_{D} A\right)=\cdots=\lambda_{m}\left(P_{D} A\right) & =0 \\
\lambda_{n}\left(P_{D} A\right) & \leq \lambda_{n}\left(P_{C} A\right) \\
\lambda_{m+1}\left(P_{D} A\right) & \geq \lambda_{1}\left(P_{C} A\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Deflation and Coarse Grid Correction (main result)

Theorem
Let $A$ be symmetric positive definite and $Z$ has rank $Z=m$. Let $E:=Z^{T} A Z$. Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
\lambda_{1}\left(P_{D} A\right)=\cdots=\lambda_{m}\left(P_{D} A\right) & =0 \\
\lambda_{n}\left(P_{D} A\right) & \leq \lambda_{n}\left(P_{C} A\right) \\
\lambda_{m+1}\left(P_{D} A\right) & \geq \lambda_{1}\left(P_{C} A\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Theorem

$Z_{1} \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times r}, Z_{2} \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times s}, r a n k Z_{1}=r$ and rank $Z_{2}=s$. If $\operatorname{Im} Z_{1} \subseteq \operatorname{Im} Z_{2}$, then

$$
\begin{aligned}
\lambda_{n}\left(\left(I-A Z_{1} E_{1}^{-1} Z_{1}^{T}\right) A\right) & \geq \lambda_{n}\left(\left(I-A Z_{2} E_{2}^{-1} Z_{2}^{T}\right) A\right) \\
\lambda_{r+1}\left(\left(I-A Z_{1} E_{1}^{-1} Z_{1}^{T}\right) A\right) & \leq \lambda_{s+1}\left(\left(I-A Z_{2} E_{2}^{-1} Z_{2}^{T}\right) A\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

TU Delft

## Deflation and Coarse Grid Correction combined with a preconditioner

Definition

$$
P_{C M^{-1}}:=M^{-1}+\sigma Z E^{-1} Z^{T} .
$$

Theorem
Let $A$ and $M$ be symmetric positive definite. Let $Z \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$ with $\operatorname{rank} Z=m$. Let $E:=Z^{T} A Z$. Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
\lambda_{n}\left(M^{-1} P_{D} A\right) & \leq \lambda_{n}\left(P_{C M^{-1}} A\right), \\
\lambda_{m+1}\left(M^{-1} P_{D} A\right) & \geq \lambda_{1}\left(P_{C M^{-1}} A\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

Corollary
DICCG converges faster than CICCG for general projection vectors.

TU Delft

## 4. Numerical experiments

Oil flow problem


| method | Deflation | CGC |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| iterations | 36 | 47 |
| CPU time | 5.9 | 8.2 |

TU Delft


## Poisson on parallel layers

## Iterations



## Poisson on parallel layers

## Iterations



## Poisson on parallel layers

Iterations


## Wall clock time



## Poisson on layers and blocks

## Layers



## Poisson on layers and blocks

## Layers



Blocks


## 5. Conclusions

- Block preconditioned Krylov methods combined with Deflation or CGC are well parallelizable (scalable, good speed up).
- For the vertex centered case, the weighted overlap strategy is optimal
- DICCG is more efficient than CICCG.
- Choices for the deflation vectors lead to comparable results in DICCG and CICCG.
- DICCG is a robust and efficient method to solve diffusion problems with discontinuous coefficients.


## Further information

- http://ta.twi.tudelft.nl/nw/users/vuik/pub_it_def.html
- C. Vuik, A. Segal and J.A. Meijerink J. Comp. Phys., 152, pp. 385-403, 1999.
- J. Frank and C. Vuik SIAM Journal on Scientific Computing, 23, pp. 442-462, 2001
- C. Vuik, A. Segal, L. El Yaakoubi and E. Dufour Applied Numerical Mathematics, 41, pp. 219-233, 2002
- F.J. Vermolen, C. Vuik and A. Segal
J. of Comp. Methods in Sciences and Engineering, to appear
- R. Nabben and C. Vuik

A comparison of Deflation and Coarse Grid Correction, to appear

Krylov $A r$

## Preconditioned Krylov

Block Preconditioned Krylov

Block Preconditioned Deflated Krylov $\sum_{i=1}^{m}\left(L_{i}^{-T} L_{i}^{-1}\right) P A r$

